

CHAPTER 22 THE ADJUSTED WINNER METHOD: HOMEWORK

1. In class we found one division resulting from the adjusted winner method for the following problem. Below you will find an alternate division that results from using the adjusted winner method.

A and B want to share a cake with five homogeneous components, C_1 to C_5 . Their valuations are as follows:

| | C_1 | C_2 | C_3 | C_4 | C_5 |
|-----|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| A | $\frac{1}{10}$ | $\frac{5}{10}$ | $\frac{1}{10}$ | $\frac{2}{10}$ | $\frac{1}{10}$ |
| B | $\frac{1}{10}$ | $\frac{1}{10}$ | $\frac{3}{10}$ | $\frac{2}{10}$ | $\frac{3}{10}$ |

Answer the following questions.

- (a) Let p be the fraction of component C_4 that A receives. Find the value of p corresponding to the division

$$A : C_2 + C_1 + pC_4,$$

$$B : (1 - p)C_4 + C_3 + C_5$$

$$0.5 + 0.1 + 0.2p = 0.2(1 - p) + 0.3 + 0.3,$$

$$0.4p = 0.2,$$

$$p = \frac{0.2}{0.4} = \frac{1}{2}.$$

- (b) To what threshold value r does this division correspond?

$$r = \frac{0.2}{0.2} = 1.$$

- (c) Check that this division is indeed equitable.

$$A : C_2 + C_1 + pC_4 = 0.5 + 0.1 + \left(\frac{1}{2} \cdot 0.2\right) = 0.7;$$

$$B : (1 - p)C_4 + C_3 + C_5 = \left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\right) \cdot 0.2 + 0.3 + 0.3 = 0.7.$$

- (d) Explain why this division is Pareto-optimal.

It is a threshold division and all threshold divisions are Pareto-optimal.

2. Suppose A and B divide a cake consisting of 4 homogeneous components, $C, S, P,$ and W . Suppose the valuations are

| | C | S | P | W |
|-----|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| A | $\frac{6}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{1}{15}$ | $\frac{5}{15}$ |
| B | $\frac{6}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ |

Find 2 *different* divisions using the adjusted winner method and check that each of them is equitable.

First calculate the A -to- B valuation ratios:

| | C | S | P | W |
|-------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| A | $\frac{6}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{1}{15}$ | $\frac{5}{15}$ |
| B | $\frac{6}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ | $\frac{3}{15}$ |
| Ratio | 1 | 1 | $\frac{1}{3}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ |

In decreasing order, the ratios are $5/3$ for W , 1 for C and S , and $1/3$ for P .

The threshold line for the adjusted winner method starts at $r = 1$. The resulting division, if p is the fraction of component C that A receives and q is the fraction of component S that A receives, is

$$\begin{aligned} A &: W + pC + qS, \\ B &: P + (1 - p)C + (1 - q)S. \end{aligned}$$

Substitute in the valuations and set the share equal:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{5}{15} + p\frac{6}{15} + q\frac{3}{15} &= \frac{3}{15} + (1 - p)\frac{6}{15} + (1 - q)\frac{3}{15} \\ \frac{12}{15}p + \frac{6}{15}q &= \frac{7}{15} \\ 12p + 6q &= 7. \end{aligned}$$

If $q = 0$, then $p = \frac{7}{12}$ works, and if $q = 1$, then $p = \frac{1}{12}$ works.

Plug these in to check: for $p = \frac{7}{12}$ and $q = 0$,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{5}{15} + \frac{7}{12} \cdot \frac{6}{15} &= \frac{5}{15} + \frac{5}{12} \cdot \frac{6}{15} + \frac{3}{15}, \\ \frac{5}{15} + \frac{7}{30} &= \frac{6}{15} + \frac{5}{30}, \\ \frac{17}{30} &= \frac{17}{30}. \end{aligned}$$

For $p = \frac{1}{12}$ and $q = 1$,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{5}{15} + \frac{1}{12} \cdot \frac{6}{15} + \frac{3}{15} &= \frac{3}{15} + \frac{11}{12} \cdot \frac{6}{15}, \\ \frac{8}{15} + \frac{1}{30} &= \frac{3}{15} + \frac{11}{30} \\ \frac{17}{30} &= \frac{17}{30}. \end{aligned}$$